

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Minutes

August 9, 2007

Salisbury, North Carolina

The Historic Preservation Commission for the City of Salisbury met in regular session on Thursday, August 9, 2007, in the Council Chambers at the City Hall, 217 S. Main Street.

The meeting was called to order by the Chairperson, Anne Lyles.

She welcomed all persons present and explained the meeting's purpose and procedures

The following members were present and introduced themselves: Ronald Fleming, Deborah Johnson, Judy Kandl, Kathy Walters, and Anne Waters.

Absent: Jack Errante, Susan Hurt

Ms. Lyles announced that the request submitted for 727 S. Fulton St. would not be heard.

Requests for Certificates of Appropriateness

H-36-07 **207 S. Ellis St.** – John Knox Bridges and Wanda Jean Johnson Bridges, owner;
Ramsay Burgin Smith Architects, agent

Request: Construction of new garage/carport in rear yard.

Judy Kandl requested to recuse herself for the hearing of the request. A motion was made by Kathy Walters; seconded by Deborah Johnson, and all voted AYE.

Bill Burgin, agent, was sworn to give testimony for the request.

Staff presented slides as Mr. Burgin informed the Commission that the proposed carport/storage building will replace the dilapidated carport which was demolished following an earlier approval. The new structure will be located in about the same spot as the original one and will meet the new setbacks. Also, he continued, building materials would be compatible with materials in the surrounding areas. He testified that 2 non-decorative motion sensor utility lights would be located on the outside of the building.

Mr. Burgin referred Commission members to the submitted drawings which illustrated the heights and proportions of the building. The proposed windows are aluminum-clad with the same proportions and grills as what is original to the house. The door will be painted or aluminum-clad. The siding, which has the appearance of wood, but more durable, will be painted. He said, "This being a new building we want to use the new products which are a little more durable." The columns and the trim will be made from a resin-bonded wood fiber product which has been used before in the historic district on new construction.

Kathy Walters stated that she did not remember that aluminum-clad doors or windows had ever been approved by the Commission for residential construction. However, she would have no problem with the columns and siding since hardi-plank has already been approved by the Commission as an acceptable material.

Wendy Spry informed the Commission that DRAC made the determination that it would be consistent to use metal throughout the building and she assumed that meant the windows as well.

Janet Gapen stated that a few of the aluminum-clad windows had been approved for the main structure.

Mr. Burgin testified that the windows proposed for the garage are the same windows that were not approved for the house. He explained that the owners had purchased the windows but after the Commission did not approve them, they were removed in order to put in the approved windows. He said, "It is the window that was taken out and not used but used in other places."

Anne Walters stated that, though sympathetic, she agrees with Kathy Walters. She said, "We must adhere to the guidelines."

Kathy Walters read the following guideline from New Construction – Building:

6. *Contemporary substitute materials that closely imitate historic materials may be used on a limited basis, but should not make up the majority of the finish materials on a project.*

In response to Anne Waters who asked, "What is an aluminum-clad window," Mr. Burgin said the base of the window is wood and the finish on the outside is a thin layer of aluminum. He said the mitigating circumstance is that they already have the windows.

There were no persons present to speak in support or opposition to the request.

Kathy Walters made the following motion: "I move that the Commission find the following facts concerning Application #H-36-07 – that Bill Burgin, agent for John Knox & Wanda Jean Johnson Bridges, owners of 207 S. Ellis Street, appeared before the Commission and south a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new garage/carport in the rear yard; that no one appeared before the Commission to support or oppose this request, this request should be granted based on The Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Chapter 2 – Changes to Buildings – Garages and Outbuildings, pages 24-25, guidelines, 1-7 and Building guidelines 1-11 of the Residential Historic District Design Guidelines; no mitigating factors; therefore, I further move that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application #H-36-07 be granted to Bill, Burgin, agent for John Knox & Wanda Jean Johnson Bridges, owners of 207 S. Ellis St., to make the changes detailed in the application with the following change agreed to by the applicant: referring to Chapter 3 New Construction & Additions, Building guideline 6, windows and doors in the new structure will be wood."

Ronald Fleming seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

Judy Kandl returned to her seat following a motion from Kathy Walters; seconded Deborah Johnson and all members voting AYE.

H-37-07 **133 S. Main St.** – Arnold D. Loflin & Alan Dave Loflin, owner;
Lynn Raker, applicant

Request: (1) 36.5' x 60.5' brick paver parking/event lot
 (2) Repair brick wall behind parking lot
 (3) Landscape between lot and back wall and between lot and alley
 (4) Install panels with artwork on back wall

Dave Loflin, owner, and Lynn Raker, city's Urban Design Planner, were sworn to give testimony for the request.

Mr. Loflin informed the Commission that they had been awarded money to do the parking lot at the rear of his business, Thread Shed, located at 133 S. Main St. He stated that the availability of the matching funds was brought to their attention by Lynn Raker.

Mr. Loflin testified that a 36.5 x 60.5 ft. brick paver parking lot would be installed. Landscaping, he continued, would be done between the lot and back wall, and between the lot and alley. Also, Crepe Myrtles would be planted. In addition, a brick wall located behind the parking lot will be repaired. From the slides he indicated the area of the wall that had been repaired about 6 or 8 years ago using stucco and painted, which he said, "held up quite well." He testified that they would like to continue the repair in the same way that it was done. He said, "We feel like that would probably be a better solution and an affordable solution."

Mr. Loflin informed the Commission that some type of artwork would probably be added to the wall once it is repaired, but that would be brought to the Commission for approval at another time.

Judy Kandl asked Mr. Loflin if the repair would apply to the part below the roof only or would it apply to the wall above it also.

Mr. Loflin testified that the high roof that she was referring to was not their property but belonged to Mr. Oestreicher.

In response to Mrs. Kandl's question in reference to the final color of the stucco repair, Mr. Loflin stated that it would be Stone Gray matching the existing paint, and possibly a green color for the trim.

Judy Kandl informed Mr. Loflin and Commission members that the proposed brick paver parking/event lot is in compliance with the guidelines by the selection of material and paint, color, and the intent.

In response to Mrs. Kandl's question concerning the alley, Janet Gapen stated that the 10 ft. alley would remain the same. She further informed the Commission that the lighting would be approved later.

In reference to landscaping, Janet Gapen stated that enough information was submitted for the landscaping plan, and Wendy Spry informed the Commission that Lynn Raker would be the consultant for the landscaping.

Lynn Raker stated that there may be some minor adjustments to the positioning of some of the planters if anything unforeseen was found.

There was no one present to speak in support or opposition to the request.

Ronald Fleming made the following motion:

“I move that the Commission find the following facts concerning Application #H-37-07 – that Lynn Raker, agent, and Dave Loflin, owner of 133 S. Main Street, appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 36.5’ x 60.5’ brick paver parking/event lot, repair and painting of brick wall behind the lot using colors to match the existing building, landscaping between the lot and back wall and alley, and the installation of artwork panels on the back wall; that no one appeared before the Commission to support or oppose this request, this request should be granted based on The Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Chapter 2- Changes to Buildings – Side and Rear Facades, pages 26-28, guidelines 1-3, Chapter 4 – Site Features and District Setting – Parking & Paving, pages 57-58, guidelines 1-4 and Landscaping & Streetscape, pages 59-60, guidelines 1,2,7 and 8 of the Non-Residential Historic District Design Guidelines; no mitigating factors; therefore, I further move that a Certificate of Appropriateness be granted to Lynn Raker, applicant for Arnold D., and Alan Dave Loflin, owners of 133 S. Main Street, to make the changes detailed in the application with the following changes agreed to by the applicant: elimination of the installation of artwork panels on the back wall until plans can be brought to the Commission at a later time.”

Anne Waters seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

H-38-07 **415 S. Ellis St. – Anita Cathey Ryan, owner**
Request: Attach wood shutters, painted White to match trim.

Kevin Ryan was sworn to give testimony for the request. Staff presented slides.

Mr. Ryan testified that they would like to add shutters onto the front of the house. The shutters will be located at the windows on the ground level of the house and the dormer window on the second story. They would be raised and painted to match the trim of the house.

In response to a question from Kathy Walters, Mr. Ryan said he did not have any evidence that shutters were original to the house. He said, “Not to my knowledge.”

Ronald Fleming commented that he did not think there was room enough for shutters on the top story.

Kathy Walters read the following guidelines from the **Windows and Doors Guidelines**:

6. *Construct replacement shutters of wood, size them to window openings, and mount them so that they are operable. It is not appropriate to introduce window shutters where no evidence of earlier shutters exists.*

Ms. Walters informed Mr. Ryan that the shutters should be sized to close and cover the windows. She said, "In this case that would not be possible."

Mrs. Ryan presented a picture of the proposed shutters which showed a different proportion than the submitted drawing.

In response to a question from Judy Kandl, Mr. Ryan clarified that the request for shutters on the porch windows should be eliminated.

Anita Ryan was sworn to give testimony for the request.

Mrs. Ryan testified that her house and the house next door were built at approximately the same time. She said as far as she knows there have always been shutters on both houses.

Betty Carli, resident in the house next door at 419 S. Ellis St., was sworn to give testimony for the request.

Mrs. Carli testified that the shutters on her house are original. She said she thinks that shutters on the Ryan's home would be very nice. The house on the other side, she stated, also has shutters. She further informed the Commission that none were working shutters.

There was no one present to speak in opposition to the request.

In response to a question from Kathy Walters, Mr. Ryan said they would be willing to install the shutters in an operable manner.

Anne Waters made the motion as follows: "I move that the Commission find the following facts concerning Application #H-38-07 – that Kevin Ryan, owner, 415 S. Ellis St., appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness to attach White painted wood shutters to the house; that Betty Carli appeared before the Commission to support this request, this request should be granted based on The Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, and Chapter 2 – Changes to Buildings – Windows and Doors, pages 16-19, guideline 6 of the Residential Historic District Design Guidelines; there were no mitigating factors; therefore, I further move that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application #H-38-07 be granted to Anita Cathey Ryan & Kevin Ryan, owners of 415 S. Ellis St., to make the changes detailed in the application, with the following changes agreed to by the applicant: shutters will be installed as working shutters, and windows on the enclosed porch will not have shutters."

Ronald Fleming seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

H-39-07 **305 N. Lee St.** – Rowan Investment Company, owner;
Michael Lippard, agent

Request: New aluminum windows, new doors, new awnings, new overhead door, paint brick at front façade, new ramp and loading and railing, new lighting, and renovations as per submitted plans.

Mike Lippard, agent for Rowan Investment, was sworn to give testimony for the request.

Staff presented slides as Mike Lippard informed the Commission of the proposed project as follows:

- New overhead garage door to replace the old one
- Paint the masonry on the front of the building
- Uncover the existing bricked-up windows and paint Black
- Paint small concrete bumpers located on both sides of the garage door, Black
- Add gooseneck and jelly-jar lights under the awning at the entrance door
- Install metal awnings

He said they have met with Paul Fomberg from the State Historic Preservation Office in reference to tax credits, and he was happy with the proposal.

In reference to a question from Kathy Walters, Mr. Lippard said the rear and side of the building will not be painted and remain with the existing brick. He said they had considered trying to remove the paint from the brick on the façade but right now it was cost prohibitive.

He presented a color chip of the beige color which will be used for the masonry on the front of the building. He further testified that the awnings, windows, and lights would all be Black, and the overhead garage doors and the entry door will be Olive Green.

In response to a question from Ronald Fleming, Michael Lippard testified that all of the original windows are still there except one on the rear of the building which will be replaced with a matching window.

Diane Young, General Contractor, was sworn to give further testimony for the request.

Diane Young informed the Commission that as Michael Lippard had testified, all of the original windows were found sandwiched between the brick. All of the brick would be removed to expose the original windows with thermal pane clear glass units installed in each window. A new aluminum frame window with dividers will go into the opening where the window was not found.

She stated that the garage door would be made to match the door at 307 N. Lee because they believe that is what would fit the period of the building. A new wood door will be made to match the existing panel door which is in a non-repairable state.

The brick corbelling at the top of the building, she continued, will need to be repaired.

Diane Young further testified that the rear windows may come out at a later time; however, the brick on the inside would be removed so that when the owner is financially ready to take on the rear windows, his business would not be affected by the brick's removal.

The right rear doors will be replaced with metal plush doors in order to provide the best security. The existing door opening on the left side which has been bricked in will be reopened and used as the handicap access. A concrete handicap ramp will replace the existing brick piers.

Judy Kandl noted that one of the historic district guidelines state that masonry colors should approximate the masonry that originally started in the building. In her questions concerning the cream and gold combination proposed for the building, she asked if the buildings downtown that are painted in lots of different colors has set a precedent for that building as opposed to what the guidelines propose.

Diane Young responded by informing the Commission that she was not aware of the guideline stating that the brick should match the original paint; however, her experience with the State has always been that the National Park Service wants a paint color that is the natural color of brick. She explained that she chose the tan color over red because red often times has a tendency to fade.

She further explained that the owner would like each building to stand on its own. She said there would be other brick colors requested as the projects continue down the block.

There was no one present to speak in support or opposition to the request.

Kathy Walters made the following motion: "I move that the Commission find the following facts concerning Application #H-39-07 – that Michael Lippard and Diane Young, agents for Rowan Investment Company, owner of 305 N. Lee St., appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new aluminum windows, doors, awnings, overhead door, lighting, ramp and loading and railings, paint the front façade in a cream color, and do renovations as per submitted plan, that no one appeared before the Commission to support or oppose this request, this request should be granted based on The Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation and Chapter 2 – Changes to Buildings – Windows and Doors, pages 30, 31, guidelines 1-12, and Safety & Accessibility, page 41, guidelines 1-6; Chapter 4 – Site Features and District Setting – Signage & Awnings, pages 54-56, guidelines 10-15 of the Non-Residential Historic District Design Guidelines; no mitigating factors; therefore, I further move that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application #H-39-07 be granted to Rowan Investment Company, owner of 305 N. Lee St., to make the changes detailed in the application with the following changes agreed to by the applicant: the existing door will be replaced because of its poor condition; the original windows will be used given that they have been found between the layers of brick in the openings wherever possible."

Deborah Johnson seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

H-40-07 **307 N. Lee St.** – Rowan Investment Company, owner

Request: New aluminum windows, new doors, new awnings, new lighting, new recessed entry, and renovations as per submitted plans.

Michael Lippard informed the Commission that the building at 307 N. Lee is very similar to 305 N. Lee St. He said they hope to find metal windows in areas as noted on the submitted plans where windows would be located. However, he said that all windows will be new if the original windows cannot be found.

The masonry will be painted a beige color which is slightly different from the 305 building.

He stated that because there were no existing walk-thru doors at the front of the building, there would be recessed entries with stairs to allow entry into the building. The storefront doors will be aluminum; the sheetrock will be painted a beige color to match the brick; the ceilings in the recessed area will be white; the overhead doors, red; awnings and lights, black.

In response to questions from Judy Kandl regarding the front entry into the building, Michael Lippard stated that for security purposes they wanted to keep that entry solid.

Michael Lippard informed the Commission that Duke Power would be pulling down their existing power poles in order to move the electricity to underground. From the slides, he pointed out the power poles which are located in the middle of the sidewalk, creating the need to move the existing transformer across the street. The conduits will be piped underneath the buildings and all the electrical items will be in the electrical equipment room.

Diane Young informed the Commission that the owner approached Duke Power with their own solution as to how to get the utilities underground. “She said, “This is owner driven and owner financed.” She further stated that the room in the corner of the building at 307 will house all of the electricity for cable, phones and utilities.

Kathy Walters said, “We commend the owner.”

Michael Lippard informed the Commission that the state now requires all buildings that have sprinkler systems to have a back-flow preventer. He said if the back-flow preventer should at any time fail, it would cause a humongous amount of water to go everywhere; therefore, an additional larger scupper would be installed in order to handle the water flow in case it was ever needed.

Diane Young stated that the sprinkler contractor is in the process of calculating the volume of water for the size reservoir needed, so there is a possibility that 2 scuppers may be needed.

There was no one present to speak in support or opposition to the request.

Deborah Johnson made the following motion: “I move that the Commission find the following facts concerning Application #H-40-07 – that Michael Lippard and Diane Young, agents for Rowan Investment Co., owner of 307 N. Lee St., appeared before the Commission and sought a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new aluminum windows, doors, awnings, lighting, and recessed entry, and do renovations as per submitted plan; that no one appeared before the Commission to support or oppose this request; this request should be granted based on The Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, and Chapter 2 – Changes to Buildings – Windows and Doors, pages 30-31, guidelines 1-12; Chapter 4 – Site Features and District Setting – Signage & Awnings, pages 54-56, guidelines 10-15 of the Non-Residential Historic District Design Guidelines; mitigating factor is that Duke Power requirements are being met; therefore, I further move that a Certificate of Appropriateness for Application #H-40-07 be granted to Michael Lippard and Diane Young, agents for Rowan Investment Company, owner of 307 N. Lee St., to make the changes detailed in the application with the following changes agreed to by the applicant: the addition of 2 scuppers on the front of the building.”

Kathy Walters seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

Committee Reports

Minor works: There were no questions in reference to the submitted minor works approval list.

Other Business

Notes from Janet Gapen

- The City Council has appointed Andrew Pitner to the Commission as a new member. He will be sworn in at the September meeting.
- The guidelines committee has met and will schedule another meeting during the month. Following that meeting there will probably be recommendations for changes to the guidelines. All members present received a copy of the minutes from the meeting.
- The property owner of 315 E. Fisher St. will be in town on the 15th (August) and has requested a meeting at 10 a.m. in reference to the COA request for demolition which was heard some months ago. Ronald Fleming and Anne Waters volunteered to attend the meeting as replacements for Susan Hurt and Jack Errante who will not be able to attend.
- The Local Bill from the State allowing City Council to regulate permits for demolition in the Downtown Historic District which will now need to be incorporated into the city's code. The City Council will hear it on August 22nd.
- The Historic Salisbury Foundation has provided each member with a copy of the Forum Journal.

Wendy Spry informed the Commission that an application has been submitted to the Zoning Board of Adjustment from Mrs. Barbara Senter to appeal the Commission's decision on her request for a driveway. The meeting will be held on Monday, August 13th, 3:15 p.m. in the Council Chambers. She stated that Anne Lyles, as chairperson, would need to attend but all members are welcome to come.

She stated that no new testimony would be heard.

Minutes

The July minutes were approved with revisions following a motion from Kathy Walters, seconded by Anne Waters; all members voted AYE.

Adjournment

With no other business to come before the Commission, Kathy Walters moved for adjournment. Ronald Fleming seconded the motion; all members present voted AYE.

Anne Lyles, Chairperson

Judy Jordan, Secretary